

## **JAKARTA'S CITY BRANDING AS PARA-DIPLOMACY: BEYOND GREENING STADIUM AND RACE**

**LUERDI LUERDI**

[luerdi2202@gmail.com](mailto:luerdi2202@gmail.com)

A doctoral student in International Relations at Universiti Sultan Zainal Abidin (Malaysia). Former Assistant Professor at the Department of International Relations, Universitas Abdurrab, Indonesia. The main focus of the author's research is on the issues surrounding foreign policy and para-diplomacy.

### **Abstract**

Mega-structures and sport mega-events have been attractions in many mega-cities representing their identity to the rest of the world. Such phenomenon has also taken place in Jakarta by the existence of the newly erected Jakarta International Stadium and the recently held Formula E and both have gained attention and stimulated conversations in Indonesia. So have both been known as a green stadium and a green race. Integrating sustainability to urban development has been a global trend and Jakarta attempts to take advantage of such trend to create branding. This research aimed to describe the rationale of greening the stadium and race by the Jakarta regional government within its city branding policy. This research employed the qualitative method and descriptive analysis in addition to the concept of para-diplomacy and city branding. This research found that both green stadium and race were utilized as symbols or promotional value to promote green development in the city. City branding by the Jakarta regional government was a diplomatic practice bringing a message about the city transformation to be a green and global city. This paper provides a perspective that city branding is para-diplomacy itself or one form of para-diplomacy practices. This paper argues that through city branding, cities should be able to not only widen their specific needs locally but also pave their global role in addressing the global challenges like climate crisis. This paper benefits those who are interested in or are studying today city para-diplomacy and global urban politics.

### **Keywords**

Jakarta regional government; Jakarta International Stadium; Formula E; sustainability; green and global city.

### **Resumo**

Mega-estruturas e mega-eventos desportivos têm sido atrações em muitas mega-cidades representando a sua identidade para o resto do mundo. Tal fenómeno também teve lugar em Jacarta devido à existência do recentemente erguido Estádio Internacional de Jacarta e da Fórmula E realizada, tendo ambos ganhado atenção e estimulado discussões na Indonésia. Ambos têm sido conhecidos como um estádio verde e uma corrida verde. A integração da sustentabilidade no desenvolvimento urbano tem sido uma tendência global e Jacarta tenta tirar partido desta tendência para criar uma marca. Esta investigação visa descrever a razão de ser da ecologização do estádio e da corrida pelo governo regional de Jacarta no âmbito da sua política de marca da cidade. Foi seguido o método qualitativo e a análise descritiva, para além da análise do conceito de paradiplomacia e de marca da cidade. Como resultados, percebeu-se que tanto o estádio verde como a Fórmula E foram utilizados como símbolos ou valor promocional para promover o desenvolvimento verde na cidade. A marca da cidade utilizada pelo governo regional de Jacarta resultou numa prática diplomática que trazia uma mensagem sobre a transformação da cidade tornando-a verde e global. Este documento fornece uma perspectiva de que a marca da cidade consiste na própria paradiplomacia ou numa forma de práticas paradiplomáticas, defende que, através da marca, as cidades devem



ser capazes não só de alargar localmente as suas necessidades específicas, mas também de reforçar o seu papel global na abordagem dos desafios globais como a crise climática. Este documento beneficia aqueles que estão interessados ou que estudam hoje a paradiplomacia das cidades e a política urbana global.

**Palavras-chave**

Governo regional de Jacarta; Estádio Internacional de Jacarta; Fórmula E; sustentabilidade; cidade verde e global

**How to cite this article**

Luerdi, Luerdi (2023). Jakarta's city branding as para-diplomacy: beyond greening stadium and race, *Janus.net, e-journal of international relations*, Vol14 N1, May-October 2023. Consulted [online] in date of last visit, <https://doi.org/10.26619/1647-7251.14.1.9>

**Article received on November, 23 2022, accepted for publication on March, 11 2023**





## **JAKARTA'S CITY BRANDING AS PARA-DIPLOMACY: BEYOND GREENING STADIUM AND RACE**

**LUERDI LUERDI**

### **Introduction**

Global politics and international relations are no longer limited to the issues of hard politics, such as state security and sovereignty. International communities are currently challenged by more various global issues and the entities below national governments like cities have been showing their interests and active engagement in addressing them. Cities especially mega-cities seems impossible to restrict themselves from the issues as they are the most directly exposed to the impacts and the excesses of their national governments' foreign policy and diplomacy. That cities attempt to respond to them in both local and international level whose actions are known as para-diplomacy is the main topic in this paper.

Considering themselves as the regions within a state which are the most exposed to globalization and are loaded with better resources, cities are even attempting to take advantage of current trends to promote their interests beyond national borders. Cities have been important agents in international arena since diplomacy is no longer the state monopoly strongly attached in globalization process (Zeraoui & Villar, 2016). One of the current strategies among cities to pursue their interests is city branding, which is also becoming attention within the study of city para-diplomacy (city diplomacy). City branding is a self-sustained effort by creating good images through, such as offering excellent facilities and services and hosting various events. City branding which is believed to contribute to multiple positive impacts to the cities is not only as an economic tool, but also as a central element of urban development (Zeraoui & Villar, 2016).

Jakarta is just like other world's mega-cities attempts to create attractions through city branding towards its audiences. Jakarta has just had another new mega-structure called the Jakarta International Stadium (JIS) which began its construction in 2019 and was completed in 2022. Located in the coastline area of the northern Jakarta, the stadium has been widely known as a new icon of the city. In addition, Jakarta has been a global attention as it has recently hosted a sport mega-event called the Formula E (Jakarta E-Prix). The Formula E is a global motorsport event whose race cars count on electric batteries in stead of fossil fuel, so that it is also known as a net zero-emission motorsport event. Besides having triggered conversations among domestic as well as international audiences, both the JIS and the Formula E have similar characteristic, that is applying the principle of environmental sustainability.



The Jakarta regional government has been promoting the JIS and the Jakarta E-Prix since last few months when the COVID-19 pandemic began to decrease in the city. However, the case of city branding and para-diplomacy regarding the new icons have not yet gained wide attention among scholars. This paper sheds light on how the mega-structure and mega-event alike matter in Jakarta's city branding facilitating the message spreading beyond merely as a landmark and an event.

### Literature review

The studies of para-diplomacy have been becoming a rising interest among scholars within the realm of international relations that there exists literature on para-diplomacy worldwide with a variety of actors and objects as research foci. This section provides a brief review of several previous works which can be categorized in four different groups, such as sports diplomacy, city branding, branding sustainability, and other types of para-diplomacy. Despite the groupings, they share some key concepts and meaningfully complement each other. The literature that this study attempts to assess is the following:

Table 1. Studies of Para-Diplomacy from Sports Diplomacy to Other Types of Para-Diplomacy

Sports Diplomacy	City Branding	Branding Sustainability	Para-Diplomacy (Others)
Acuto, 2013a (city global role)	Auschner <i>et al.</i> , 2020 (identity creation)	Noori & De Jong, 2018 (local transformation)	Erlandsen, 2018 (digital diplomacy)
McDowell, 2022 (regional identity insertion)	Jelinčić <i>et al.</i> , 2017 (identity creation)		Ruiz-Campillo, 2022 (city networks)
	Ulldemolins, 2014 (global competition)		Suharyadi, 2016 (city networks)
	Zamorano & Morató, 2015 (global competition)		Lee, 2014 (city translocal relations)

Source: compiled by author.

Para-diplomacy through global sporting events have been studied by a few scholars (Acuto, 2013a; McDowell, 2022). The city initiated to host a global sporting event as a reaffirmation of primacy on its environmental policy making (Acuto, 2013a). The city has attempted to demonstrate its capability and play its global role by associating its para-diplomacy to environmental sustainability which is one of the global concerns (Acuto, 2013a). Similarly, a study by Lee (2014) suggests that cities' local efforts go beyond national boundaries to enhance their role to combat climate crisis. On the other hand, McDowell (2022) argued that an overseas territory inserted its identity to forward its polity by participating in a global sporting event.

It is widely known that branding cities has been a para-diplomacy strategy for sub-national governments to attract investments, tourists, and capitals. A number of scholars have studied city branding through various case studies (Auschner *et al.*, 2020; Jelinčić *et al.*, 2017; Ulldemolins, 2014; Zamorano & Morató, 2015). Those studies attempt to suggest city branding as the creation of a new identity (Auschner *et al.*, 2020; Jelinčić *et al.*, 2017) and a strategy for global competition (Ulldemolins, 2014; Zamorano & Morató, 2015). City branding has been created through transformation in diplomacy (Zamorano



& Morató, 2015) and internationalization of local development (Auschner *et al.*, 2020). Despite their different case studies, they suggest culture as the main driver of city branding (Jelinčić *et al.*, 2017; Ulldemolins, 2014; Zamorano & Morató, 2015). Slightly different from the others, in addition to cultural factor Jelinčić *et al.*, (2017) suggests the role of community participation in building city branding which differentiates city branding from destination branding.

City branding as strategy for a global competition is not only a concern among cities in the more open countries but also those in a close country as studied by Noori and De Jong (2018). That the cities in the close country are open to global competition has been driven by industrial transformation and ecological modernization in the post-oil era (Noori & De Jong, 2018). Unlike the studies emphasizing on city para-diplomacy and city branding, Erlandsen (2018) has studied para-diplomacy for nation branding through digital diplomacy. However, social media as tools of para-diplomacy tended to facilitate the conversation about independence from a mother country instead of nation branding or identity of the region (Erlandsen, 2018).

Cities also take advantage of the existence of global fora and networks as platforms in which they can practice their para-diplomacy more actively and more effectively. The studies on the roles of such platforms towards city para-diplomacy development have been conducted by a few scholars (Ruiz-Campillo, 2022; Suharyadi, 2016). The platform can facilitate a city to increase its branding and cooperations (Suharyadi, 2016). In addition, the platform can pave the local initiatives adopting sustainability to gain international visibility and recognition (Ruiz-Campillo, 2022).

From the abovementioned review, para-diplomacy by sub-national governments and branding by cities have been common practices within international relations in which states are no longer the only actors and national interests are no longer the only motivation of interactions nor actions beyond borders. Sub-national governments have put attention to their specific needs which they run after through para-diplomacy. As the world is facing enormous challenges and problems, not only national but also sub-national governments have to address them.

One of the global issues which has been a world's common problem is climate crisis. Cities especially those in the developed world have raised their concern about sustainability as many ecological problems grow in the cities. The studies conducted by Acuto (2013a), Lee (2014), and Ruiz-Campillo (2022) have revealed that how cities thanks to their local green development attempt to play a more ambitious role in the global stage as the actors promoting and championing environmental sustainability. Even the cities with less sophisticated methods have also attempted to transform towards ecological development (Noori & De Jong, 2018).

Despite growing interest in and commitment to green development or sustainability among city governments, the studies on city para-diplomacy regarding the issue is still limited and the existing literature is dominantly observing the cities in developed countries as good examples instead of those in developing world. Furthermore, the study on city branding regarding sustainability-linked global trend, especially by Jakarta is still rare. Not only does this study have strong relevance to the previous works, it also benefits from the key concepts they have offered.



## Conceptual framework

### Para-Diplomacy

Para-diplomacy is an interdisciplinary study with a variety of dimensions. In the realm of international relations, among scholars para-diplomacy is the “part of broadening of the universe of international affairs” (Keating, 2013). Simply, para-diplomacy is foreign or external relations of sub-national governments as a “form of political communication for reaching economic, cultural, political, or any other types of benefits” (Kuznetsov, 2015). Para-diplomatic activities by sub-national governments are self-sustained actions towards foreign governmental and non-governmental actors (Kuznetsov, 2015). According to Kuznetsov (2015), regional governments<sup>1</sup> are the actors of para-diplomacy representing the regions below national governments’ authority such as cities, provinces, states, and other kinds of autonomous regions with lower authorities. However, some studies have shown that para-diplomacy is not the only privilege of regional governments but also the participating area of non-governmental actors within a sovereign country (Añorve *et al.*, 2022; Meissner & Warner, 2021). Another view also suggests that para-diplomacy refer to the actors themselves – while para-diplomacy is the actors, diplomacy is the activities – as para-diplomacy is the plural form of diplomacy (Melisen, cited in Fathun, 2022).

Both internal and external institutions called opportunity structure are the common determinants for a sub-national government to pursue its interest through para-diplomacy (Keating, 2013; Lecours, 2002). Opportunity structure is any internal and external institution which the regions are exposed to, either allowing or encouraging them to conduct para-diplomatic activities. Regarding the opportunity structure, for instance, globalization and the rise of international regimes have obscured a distinctive line between domestic and foreign affairs which bring a consequence that the responsibility divisions between state and sub-national governments are inevitable (Keating, 2013). A national government will find it difficult to manage an expanding range of international linkages, economic interdependence, and the demands of policy issues alone without involving its sub-national governments. Moreover, a national government can only provide general needs within the country and it is the responsibility of sub-national governments to fulfil the regional specific needs (Hocking, 1993). Meanwhile the para-diplomacy strategy is the result of the existing opportunity structure and motivations generated by the sub-national government (Keating, 2013).

Para-diplomacy can be carried out by sub-national governments in a various form of actions, starting from attending ceremonial events involving foreign entities to signing international treaties or campaigning for secession. Little does literature study disharmonious relationship between national and sub-national governments shown by their para-diplomatic practices. Instead, para-diplomacy is often seen as an intersection of public diplomacy and state foreign policy which suggests para-diplomacy by sub-national governments to be the extension of state foreign policy. It means that sub-national governments’ external relations are purposively conducted to assist the

---

<sup>1</sup> Alexander Kuznetsov (2015) would rather use the phrase ‘regional government’ in para-diplomacy study to refer to the local governments ruling all kinds of regions sub-ordinate to their national governments. However, this paper also uses a similar phrase ‘sub-national government’ which can be interchangeably used.



pursuance of national interests. However, Keating (2013) suggests a distinctive line between para-diplomacy and conventional diplomacy or state diplomacy since the former is more “functionally specific and targeted” and often “opportunistic and experimental.” Thus, sub-national governments can project para-diplomacy driven by their distinctive motives as well as opportunity structure to pursue regional interests either without harming national interests or in addition to supporting state diplomacy.

Referring to para-diplomacy concept elaborated above – despite the absence of consensus on para-diplomacy – this paper introduces the Jakarta regional government as the actor. Jakarta’s para-diplomacy is a political communication driven by both motives and opportunity structure to be a green and global city. Integrating the values of environmental sustainability to infrastructure and events has been a global trend especially in developed countries. Thanks to the cities’ increased role and sustaining activism, green development has been a global norm penetrating national boundaries so that cities begin to consider that human activities must be friendly to environment including infrastructure provision and recreational activities.

Green development or sustainability is the opportunity structure that the Jakarta regional government has been attempting to catch. Localizing sustainability such as building a green stadium like the JIS and hosting a green race like the Formula E compliant with the global norm is a regional attempt to promote the city’s green transformation to its audiences. Such transformation is also expected to create an image that Jakarta is transforming to be a sustainable and livable global city with more active global engagement.

## City Branding

Just like para-diplomacy, city branding attracts attention of scholars from various disciplines including international relations. While brand is widely known as a “name, term, sign, symbol, or a combination of them” (Kasapi & Cela, 2017), branding is the “activity of giving a particular name and image to goods and services so that people will be attracted to them” (Oxford University Press, 2022). Rooted in management and marketing world, branding cities is increasingly necessary for regional governments especially those exposed to globalization to benefit from the interconnected world through either competition or cooperation. As para-diplomacy studies grow, its purposes and functions also expand, including to strengthen region or city branding (Auschner *et al.*, 2020). City branding is often associated to creating identity of the city. Meanwhile, para-diplomacy is seen as a “multifunctional vehicle for promotion of interests and identity” (Lecours, 2008). Sub-national entity may project certain regional characteristic transforming to be a brand which has promotional purposes as well as symbolic value (Zeraoui, 2016, cited in Auschner *et al.*, 2020).

In contrast, instead of seeing city branding as a purpose or function of para-diplomacy, dos Santos (2021) argues that para-diplomacy by cities (city diplomacy) and city branding overlap as both share commonalities. Considering dos Santos’ findings (dos Santos, 2021), this paper offers another view that city branding can be seen as para-diplomacy itself or one form of para-diplomatic activities by city actors projected to their local and international audiences (governments and non-governments). Despite different views on para-diplomacy and city branding relationship, this paper argues they do have



the same end, that is gaining material and non-material advantages by promoting or internationalizing local development. This is in line with what Kavaratzis (2019, cited in dos Santos, 2021) argues that city branding is the “application of branding to the development of cities”.

As city branding shares a few principles of corporate branding (Kavaratzis, 2009), regional governments act like corporate organizations. However, city branding is not restricted to promotional activities, rather it is a complete and continuous process interlinked with all marketing efforts, and it is also a common language which would facilitate interactions (Kavaratzis, 2009). Adopting the corporate branding concept, cities’ increased interests in branding can be explained by three reasons; differentiation, transparency, and cost reduction (Hulberg, 2006). Cities attempt to show that they are different or unique from their environment (differentiation) and external audiences can demand to access those behind the brand and their policies (transparency). In addition, instead of promoting several brands separately, cities can introduce certain well-resonated brands, join them, and create synergies between them (cost reduction).

Branding can demonstrate local development thanks to the regional governments’ capability of mobilizing all resources, such as ideas, capital, and local knowledge which lead to collaboration (Helbrecht, 1994, cited in Kavaratzis, 2004). In addition to attracting investments, tourists, and capitals, branding can enhance cities’ engagement in global politics. For example, a study by Acuto (2013a) reveals that a global city like London has ambition to be a more active player in global stage by forwarding its role as a green leader thanks to the local development it has achieved. Furthermore, regional governments are currently the main actors calling for networking and search for more intense international connectedness (Auschner *et al.*, 2020; Zamorano & Morató, 2015).

Hankinson (2004) offers four brand perspectives; brand as perceptual entities, as communicators, as relationships, and as value enhancers. Using these perspectives, city branding aims to create positive image towards cities, spread certain messages, maintain good relationship, and promote certain culture or belief. Branding is the process of shifting the function of tangible elements to the emotion of people (Auladell, 2014). Within this process, in the case of cities, at the beginning city governments may focus on improving architecture, industry, leisure areas, and other tangible elements which will evolve to the promotion of the whole city. That when places finally serve as a source for imagination of a brand creates the basis of experience among audiences.

Regarding image communication, Kavaratzis (2004) develops city-brand communication framework consisting of primary, secondary, and tertiary communication. Primary communication refers to communicative effects of city actions, but such communication is not the main goals of the actions covering four areas of intervention; (a) landscape strategies; referring both actions and decisions relevant to urban design, architecture, green spaces, and generally public spaces in the city; (b) infrastructure projects; referring to regional government’s projects developed to create, improve, or give a distinctive character to the various types of infrastructure needed in the city; (c) organizational and administrative structure; referring the effectiveness and improvement of the city governing structure; (d) behavior; referring to the city leaders’ vision, the strategy adopted, the financial incentives provided to various stakeholders, and events organized (Kavaratzis, 2004, 2009).





Though such primary communication is unintentional or indirect, the role is vital for a city to gain trust from its audiences. On the other hand, secondary communication refers to the formal, intentional communication which most commonly takes place through marketing practices, such as indoor and outdoor advertising and tertiary communication refers to communication ways other than the previous types, such as words of mouth, reinforced by media and competitors' communication (Kavaratzis, 2004). While secondary communication can be controlled by city governments' marketers, tertiary communication is uncontrollable. Thanks to today digital development, the author suggests that conversations in social media meet the latter's category.

This paper embraces the view that city branding is para-diplomacy, meanwhile branding as a decision obviously needs strategies. In this study, the Jakarta regional government's initiatives, such as building a green mega-structure following current global trend and hosting a green sport mega-event which are considered as strategies have been intended for city branding. Jakarta attempts to build an identity or characteristic of sustainability by integrating green principle to its stadium and sporting event. As the iconic landscape and event are signs and symbols as well as the primary way of communication to spread messages especially to its international community, they are expected to mold a good image of the whole city regarding its ambition to be green and global.

Promoting Jakarta's local development as the purpose of city branding will in turn facilitate the regional government to gain economic and cultural advantages. While an amount of literature suggests city branding to be a strategy for global competition (Anttiroiko, 2015; Ulldemolins, 2014; Zamorano & Morató, 2015), this paper argues city branding by the Jakarta regional government leads to collaboration with foreign entities to widen local green development. In addition to collaboration, city branding by the Jakarta regional government also aims to enhance the values of sustainability since city branding can be seen as value enhancer and through which as experienced by advanced global cities, Jakarta is expected to play more active global role in campaigning sustainability and inclusiveness among the world's cities when its local development becomes more significant in the future.

## Methods

This research applied the qualitative method and the descriptive analysis method. As a qualitative research, it was intended to comprehend "phenomena, activities, and social processes" focusing on "meanings and understanding in stead of quantification" (Bakry, 2017). The data were retrieved from the official files published by the Jakarta regional government and its affiliations as primary sources, such as report documents, pers releases, and relevant videos in addition to secondary sources like scholarly journals, books, and reliable online sources. The data were analyzed through Mile and Hubberman's interactive model or technique comprising a few steps; data collection, data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing or verification (Miles & Huberman, 1994). Employing the technique, all of the stages will cease only if the research report is really completed (Miles & Huberman, 1994).

The steps carried out based on the interactive technique during this research were as the following; firstly, an amount of early information was retrieved as a start. Secondly, data were sorted out in order to formulate a few critical questions regarding the phenomenon



to result in a specific issue. Thirdly, early conclusion or finding could be drawn, but it needed supporting by more data and during this stage, data acted to confirm such finding. As the interactive model is a cyclic technique, collecting data was supposed to still proceed along with the other steps until the research report was completed. Fourthly, the conclusion was becoming clear and strong since meanings, regularities, explanatory patterns, configurations, causalities, and propositions were convincingly recorded.

## Results and discussion

Both the iconic mega-structure and sport mega-event have demonstrated innovations integrating environmental sustainability which is a global norm as well as a global trend. Jakarta's city branding is intended to create characteristic or identity which can represent Jakarta's green transformation. In other words, the existence of the JIS and the Jakarta E-Prix is projected to promote a series of local development and tell its audiences that transformation towards a green and global city has been taking place in the city. Simultaneously, Jakarta will be able to gain material and non-material advantages, including to forward its international roles through the branding of such local development.

## Sustainability As a Global Norm

The attention on human activities and its impacts to environment has been a widely rising awareness among international communities. One of the global issues that has been affecting people lives due to ecological deterioration is climate crisis. The view that human behaviors must contribute to ecological perseverance is becoming necessary as it is a global public good. The ecological perseverance together with other global concerns has been championed through the idea of sustainability and it has been transforming to be a global norm (Mol & Zhang, 2012). The United Nations (UN) is widely known as the norm entrepreneur upholding sustainability and ensure international communities to comply with it voluntarily. In addition to the UN, sustainability is also championed by countries and international organizations worldwide. The UN has formulated 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and some of which are addressed as a set of guidelines to tackle ecological threats by countries in the world (United Nations, n.d.).

Sustainability attached in the SDGs is a global governance by goal-setting (Biermann *et al.*, 2017). One of the SDGs specifies the issue of industry, innovation, and infrastructure. The goal aims to encourage countries and other international communities to build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization, and foster innovation (United Nations, n.d.). Regarding this, it is inevitable that sustainability has been infused in sport, too. Sport industry engaging the behaviors of governments, federations, players and staffs, and fans is expected to get involve in addressing the challenges caused by the climate crisis. Green technology is supposed to be adopted in sport especially sport mega-events including their infrastructure. The Formula E which is the only net zero-emission race is one of the examples in sport industry demonstrating a green technology innovation. Furthermore, sport mega-event organizations, such as the Fédération Internationale de Football Association (FIFA) and the International Olympic Committee (IOC) have encouraged bidding countries to provide sustainable



stadiums and other eco-friendly supporting infrastructure to host the FIFA World Cup and the Olympic Games (Fermeglia, 2017).

As the actors in international relations are diverse in line with the increased global issues in number, the roles of cities are becoming more important to address them especially those related to climate crisis. Though cities only occupy 2% of the earth surface, they consume 60-80% of global energy (Sodiq *et al.*, 2019). It is also projected that the population of cities will increase up to 6.9 billion by 2050, making up 70% of the world's population (Sodiq *et al.*, 2019). The world's cities are the main contributors of emissions produced by urban mobility and industry. At the same time, they are at the forefront exposed to the impacts of ecological deterioration-caused threats, such as coastline area sinking, floods, diseases, and ecology-related social problems.

Such situation has encouraged cities to begin to adapt to climate crisis by transforming themselves to be climate resilient cities. Hence, the development – not limited to sport and leisure – driven by the sustainability norm has been inevitably adopted by city governments. Thanks to the networks of cities, sustainable agenda can be better championed by cities and cities – other than states and international organizations – are now becoming norm entrepreneurs of environmental sustainability. In addition to the role of such platforms – for example, the C40 Cities – the local initiatives related to sustainability can diffuse to other cities (Ruiz-Campillo, 2022).

### **Green Stadium and Race: Growing Global Trend**

Inspired by the European modern stadiums like the Old Trafford in Manchester and the Allianz Arena in München and followed by doubts as well as challenges caused by the pandemic of COVID-19, the Jakarta International Stadium (JIS) was one of the ambitious local projects by the Jakarta regional government which has been propagating conversations among city dwellers and citizens across Indonesia. It is the first non-athletic and multi-functional stadium applying retractable-roof technology in the country and the second featuring such technology in Southeast Asia after the Singapore's National Stadium (Jakarta Post, 2021). Its capacity of 82,000 seats currently makes it the largest retractable-roof stadium in Asia and the second-largest retractable-roof stadium in the world, only after the T&T Stadium in the United States (Jakarta Post, 2021). The stadium's construction was supervised by Buro Happold – a company experienced with the construction of modern stadiums used for the European and the World Cup tournaments – from the planning to the finishing stage which make it compliant with the standards recommended by the FIFA (Jakarta Propertindo, 2022).

In addition to unique design and modern facilities, the JIS features environmental sustainability, such as the minimizing of energy consumption through façade design, restoring solar energy, recycling water sewage, and applying zero run-off system. In domestic level, the JIS is currently the only stadium which has gained the "platinum greenship" which is the highest green predicate for green buildings from the Green Building Council Indonesia (Jakarta Regional Government, 2021a). The stadium was purposively constructed in the area which would be gradually integrated with mass transport system. It has been a common practice that modern stadiums which have earlier adopted sustainability provide such limited parking areas that fans are encouraged to use public transport means instead of private vehicles. Thus, sports and leisure



activities do not contribute to producing emission and causing traffic congestion in the cities.

Even though green stadiums are still not immensely popular in Indonesia today, as argued by Jakarta Governor Anies Rasyid Baswedan at the interview session with the CNN Indonesia, the JIS was intentionally built not only for today purpose but also for future relevance (CNN Indonesia, 2021). Since cities are becoming norm entrepreneurs, it is believed that green innovation will be the future characteristic of modern stadiums in sustainable cities. Furthermore, the pressures or demands for adoption and diffusion of pro-environmental features to sport infrastructure have been rising in some areas across continents (Kellison & Hong, 2015). In this case, the Jakarta regional government attempts to catch the momentum of such feature infrastructure as a global trend within its initiative providing a green stadium as a new icon for the city.

In addition to the stadium, the Formula E has been a new attraction in Jakarta. The Jakarta E-Prix is one of the Formula E series held in the city after officially securing the ticket to host the race for five consecutive years, from 2020 to 2024. Diplomacy for hosting the global motorsport event was conducted in 2019 through a series of negotiations and finalized in New York City after Governor Anies attended and became a speaker at the World Cities Summit Mayors Forum in Medellin, Columbia (Ramadhan *et al.*, 2022). However, the pandemic of COVID-19 forced the Jakarta regional government to renegotiate the schedule and it can eventually be conducted for three consecutive years, from 2022 to 2024.

The Fédération Internationale de l'Automobile (FIA) – the global governing body of motorsport – has put more efforts to emphasize environmental, socio-economic, and safety aspect of motorsport (Robeers & Van Den Bulck, 2018). In term of environmental aspect, the creation of the Formula E by the FIA is a breakthrough for future motorsport events. Officially known as the ABB FIA Formula E World Championship, the idea of the world's all-electric single-seater race was initiated in 2011 and came to reality in 2014 in which Beijing first hosted the race (FIA Formula E, 2022). The founding mission of the championship is to promote sustainable mobility through the races in the world's most iconic cities (FIA Formula E, 2022). As cities are the main producers of emissions caused by fossil fuel vehicles, the Formula E is designed to encourage better and cleaner world's cities through the transformation towards electric vehicles. Through the emergence of the Formula E, motorsport has worked on a significant initiative to be more environmentally and socially sustainable (Robeers & Van Den Bulck, 2018).

Not only is the Formula E still the world's race which is integrating green innovation, but it is also claimed the world's fastest growing motorsport series (FIA Formula E, 2022). The trend is demonstrated by the rising interests of on-site spectators and online viewers as well as the more races and cities across continents which participate to host the motorsport championship since its inception. While the Season 8 has recorded a 20% rise in accumulative audience compared to previous year (Sport Business, 2022), the incoming Season 9 of the Formula E is projected to have a calendar of 18 races in more than ten world's cities (FIA Formula E, 2022). Despite that the Formula E is still behind the fossil fuel Formula 1 in term of fame, it is believed that the electric motorsport is the characteristic of future generation in which environmental sustainability will be becoming more and more inevitable.



When the Jakarta regional government announced that the FIA finally approved its bidding as a host of the formula E in 2019, the criticisms and doubts have arisen around the project since then, from whether the race was able to bring attractiveness nationally and internationally as it was not as popular as the Formula 1 nor the Moto GP, to whether Jakarta was able to carry out such global event as it was the first time a city in Indonesia self-initiated the world's net zero-emission race. However, as the norm of sustainability has been embraced and integrated to Jakarta's development planning, the Formula E becomes important to symbolize the green transformation in the city. In addition, the Formula E provides the host cities opportunities to create branding by "having technologically green cars racing around iconic cityscapes" (Sturm, 2018).

While the Formula E presents a future characteristic of green sports, the JIS is a future characteristic of green buildings. The JIS is expected to promote resilient infrastructure in the city. On the other hand, the Jakarta E-Prix is expected to promote renewable energy. Both refer to the innovations which comply with the norm of sustainability and have been a rising global trend. Such green stadium and race are tangible elements which act as the media to self-brand Jakarta. From the tangible elements, as argued by Auladell (2014) they are shifted to people's emotion that Jakarta is transforming to be a green and global city in which experiences of sustainability and global characteristic can be found. Such process has involved both formal and informal image communication as suggested by Kavartzis (2004). Not only has the Jakarta regional government promoted them actively, but the pros and cons conversations on conventional and social media have also helped spread the ongoing transformation message.

### **More than Just Green Stadium and Race: Promoting Local Development**

Jakarta which is one of the world's mega-cities and the only Indonesia's city with the provincial status has been conducting its para-diplomacy actively, including in the form of city branding. As city branding means creating differentiation (Hulberg, 2006), the Jakarta regional government has been attempting to show the city to be different from its surroundings. In term of development not only as a center of business and culture, but the city has also been projecting to ambitiously adopt sustainability to its urban planning. The results on implementation of environmental sustainability to public policies are becoming tools which position the city to be distinguished from others. As one of the largest mega-cities either by size or by population in the southern hemisphere as well as the capital of one of the world's largest democracies, Jakarta is the center of national and global attention. This status eases the Jakarta regional government to function city branding as the creation of good image on as well as the spread of message about the progress the city has made as argued by Hankinson (2004) that brands can be seen as perceptual entities and communications.

As the purpose of city branding is to promote local development, the Jakarta regional government needs relevant signs or symbols which represent such development. Building the green stadium and hosting the green race are the efforts to demonstrate the green development in the city. That the JIS is still the only stadium offering sustainable technology with the highest grade of green building predicate in the domestic level and the Jakarta E-Prix is still the only global net zero-emission motorsport hosted in Indonesia can bring about perception from its audiences that Jakarta is the most progressive region



in the country in term of commitment to sustainability and is seen from outside to be capable of providing the prestigious mega-structure and sport mega-event rising as a global trend at home.

Both have been the new icons which represent the sustainable sides of the city and this is in line with the cost reduction dimension of brands as argued by Hulberg (2006). Instead of introducing all sides of development, the Jakarta regional government has decided to pick a couple of icons which can represent the whole city. Among the landscapes and events existing in the city, the ones which are related to sport like stadium and race are still the most familiar and the most easily recognized by its audiences. In addition, landscapes strategies, infrastructure projects, and events possess a vital role as the primary city-brand communication as suggested by Kavaratzis (2004, 2009).

Green transformation is the local development that the Jakarta regional government would rather promote within its city branding. In other words, it is the main message behind the greening stadium and race. That both have been attracting attention among domestic and international audiences is just a shared part of the whole transformation Jakarta wishes to introduce. Having several challenges due to climate crisis like rising sea level, flooding, and glasshouse effect as well as long-lasting problems rooted in the city like air pollution and congestion, the Jakarta regional government has begun to embrace sustainability as the solutions to tackle them. The environmentally sustainable policies have been taken to transform Jakarta to be a climate resilient city. Based on the "Jakarta Climate Resilient City: Best Practices Compilation 2021" published by the Jakarta regional government, the actions to face the climate crisis challenges can be grouped to several categories as the following (Jakarta Regional Government, 2021a):

Table 2. Jakarta's Action Plan to Face Climate Crisis

Categories	Actions
Sustainable transport and mobility	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- MRT and LRT development</li> <li>- Cycling infrastructure</li> <li>- BRT service expansion and e-bus</li> <li>- Pedestrian facilities improvement</li> <li>- Public transport integration</li> <li>- Private vehicles emission test</li> <li>- Low emission zone (LEZ)</li> <li>- Paratransit transformation</li> </ul>
Waste management	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- "Jakarta is aware of waste" campaign</li> <li>- E-waste management</li> <li>- Jakarta Recycling Centre</li> </ul>
Renewable energy usage	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Rooftop solar panel installation</li> <li>- Green building implementation</li> <li>- Energy efficiency campaign</li> </ul>
Climate adaptation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Climate kampung</li> <li>- Coastal protection</li> </ul>
Green open spaces extensification	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- City parks development (transforming gardens to parks)</li> </ul>

Source: Jakarta Regional Government (2021a)

To mitigate the climate crisis at the local level, Jakarta has formulated several policies, such as sustainable transport and mobility, waste management, renewable energy



usage, climate adaptation, and green open spaces extensification. These policies have been being implemented through several action plans, starting from transport infrastructure to city parks development which are aimed for social purpose as the third urban public spaces in addition to climate crisis mitigation in the city.

Among those efforts, the most significant and the most apparent transformation in Jakarta is the urban transport and mobility. The Jakarta regional government has been restructuring the transport and mobility in the city by embracing a new paradigm of development called transit-oriented development (Jakarta Regional Government, 2021a). The narrative of the new development is to prioritize pedestrians which are then followed by cyclists, public transport riders, and private vehicle users. Stepping up such narrative, the provision and construction of facilities must follow the needs of pedestrians, cyclists, and public transport riders ahead of private vehicle users. Considering this paradigm, the revitalization and construction of pavements, bike lanes, transit areas along with their supporting facilities must be the priorities of city decision makers. It is the opposition of car-oriented development which has been contributing to the city air pollution and stressful traffic congestion for many years since city dwellers rely on private vehicles to support their mobility.

The transit-oriented development is strongly supported by the policy to incorporate all transport modes in Jakarta to a common system called the "Jak Lingko." The transport integration system not only incorporates the network and facilities, but it also integrates the payment system (Jak Lingko Indonesia, 2022). Thanks to the transport integration complemented with supporting facilities, there has been an increase in mass public transport riders in the city, for instance, the Bus Rapid Transits (BRTs) reached a million daily riders in 2019 (Magnusson & Rachmita, 2021). The number of public transport riders is expected to keep increasing, becoming an indicator that the city transformation is on the right track. That the more people would prefer public transport means the less air pollution and traffic congestion take place in the city. With the current transport system, the Jakarta regional government targets to increase the share of public transport riders up to 60% by 2029 (Jak Lingko Indonesia, 2022). Moreover, Jakarta has decided to drop its emission to 30 % by 2030 and targeted the city to be free of emission by 2050 (Jakarta Regional Government, 2021a).

The city development needs communicating well so that it will be able to create a good image to the Jakarta regional government and the city, not only among domestic but also among international audiences. Framing the progress in the city related to sustainable development – not limited to the stadium and event – has been an important part in governing the city. Thus, Jakarta has played an important role in providing good example of green transformation in the country particularly and among the world's developing cities generally. What the Jakarta regional government has been working on is in line with Kavaratzis' city branding concept referring to the "application of branding to the city development" (dos Santos, 2021).

International recognitions that have been gained by Jakarta is believed to strengthen the city branding effort. Jakarta used to be among the world's ten most congested city before 2020. TomTom International released a report "TomTom Traffic Index 2020" telling that Jakarta could escape the notorious grouping of the 10 worst congested cities in 2020 (TomTom International, 2020). Since then, Jakarta has been showing its good



performance in decreasing the traffic jam level among the world's mega-cities. Thanks to the innovation in urban mobility including its commitment to providing decent bike lanes for cyclists, Jakarta was awarded the first position in the Sustainable Transport Award (STA) by the Institute for Transportation and Development Policy (ITDP) in 2021 (ITDP, 2021). Jakarta is the first city in the Southeast Asia to have received the prestigious award. In addition, the Transformative Urban Mobility Initiative (TUMI), which is based in Germany and has initiated the policy implementation of sustainable urban mobility in many cities, included Jakarta Governor among the "21 Heroes" in 2021 for the effort to create fair, affordable, and inclusive transportation in the time of global challenge of COVID-19 (TUMI, 2021).

Local development-driven city branding contributes to facilitating more interaction and maintaining relationship, especially between the Jakarta regional government and foreign entities like the world's city leaders and international organizations as suggested by Kavaratzis (2009) and Hankinson (2004). At the same time, both interaction and relationship strengthen prevailing city branding. Governor Anies has actively carried out on-spot diplomacy towards those entities to introduce several pilot projects integrating sustainability in the city. For instance, in the separate moments Governor Anies invited the British Secretary of State for International Trade, Rt. Hon Anne-Marie Trevelyan and Vice President of the European Investment Bank, Mr. Kris Peeters and the Europe Union Ambassador, HE Vincent Piket to have a short tour of the MRT riding and street walking around the area of Sudirman-Thamrin to promote the sustainable transport and mobility in the city (Baswedan, 2022; Luerdi, 2022b). Also, Governor Anies has recently invited and guided a tour of the U20 leaders and the C40 Cities delegates at the side event of the U20 Mayors Summit at Kota Tua (Jakarta's Old Town) which has been designated as a low emission zone (Antara, 2022b). The places introduced are the examples of current green transformation as well as the expected representation of all Jakarta in the future.

Such green development can be realized through global-local collaboration between the Jakarta regional government and various stakeholders, such as governmental and non-governmental organizations, business entities, think-tanks, and local communities as frequently well-sounded in the tagline "city of collaboration." Jakarta has emphasized collaboration as an approach in its sustainable development and currently the city has several collaboration partners, such as the C40 Cities, Bloomberg Philanthropies, Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA), ICLEI-Local Governments for Sustainability, Institute for Global Environmental Strategies (IGES), Coalition of Pedestrians, and others (Jakarta Regional Government, 2021b). Furthermore, as often claimed by the city policy makers, there have been increasing roles of local communities in the city development as city branding is supposed to be a bottom-up policy. The participations of communities are necessary in the act of branding the city, making it different from that of branding the destinations (Jelinčić *et al.*, 2017).

As transformation to be a sustainable city is a long-term goal which requires continuity, the Jakarta regional government needs to widen its local development by enhancing more global-local collaborations. For example, following Rt. Hon Anne-Marie Trevelyan's visit in the city, Governor Anies and a few officials of the Jakarta's transportation enterprises visited a few European countries for stepping up potential sustainable transport collaborations. During their visit to London, in addition to sharing the current development in Jakarta with the British business entities, PT. MRT Jakarta and the





Crossrail International signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) on the MRT investment and development (Luerdi, 2022b). On the other hand, PT. Transjakarta and the Switch Mobility Limited signed an MoU on busses electrification (Luerdi, 2022b). PT. MRT Jakarta and the European Investment Bank also signed another MoU on the MRT investment in Luxembourg (Baswedan, 2022).

The Mass Rapid Transits (MRTs) are still the backbone of transit-oriented development and transport integration policy. Jakarta has had a long-term plan for several the MRTs construction projects which will relate to all kinds of transport modes in the city. On the other hand, the provision of massive electric busses is needed to help reach the middle-term emission cut-off and the long-term net zero-emission target in the city. Jakarta has a plan to electrify all transport modes within the Jak Lingko system, not only the MRTs and the BRTs but also the minibuses by 2030 (Jakarta Regional Government, 2020). Both projects are expected to accelerate sustainable urban transport and mobility ambition by implementing sustainability principle. Local development can drive new collaborations in addition to deepening current collaborations thanks to a series of good examples the city has demonstrated. Looking at what the Jakarta regional government has done through its collaboration practices, as argued by Helbrecht (cited in Kavaratzis, 2004) that city branding leads to collaboration can be represented by the case of Jakarta.

From the above discussion, greening stadium and race has been a promotional effort by the Jakarta regional government to uphold the commitment to the norm of sustainability. Both stadium and race are the current global trend as well as examples of green development which have been attracting attention among domestic and international audiences. While the JIS aims to introduce green building implementation, the Jakarta E-Prix is an energy efficiency campaign in the city. They have a role to provide a good image to the whole city attached in city branding activity. In other words, city branding as a para-diplomacy by the Jakarta regional government in this paper is to forward a message that Jakarta is transforming to be a green and global city. As para-diplomacy is a "form of political communication" as suggested by Kuznetsov (2015), through which city branding of Jakarta aims to pursue various benefits. The city development is projected to double tourists, investments, and capitals, going parallel with the progress the city can provide to its audiences. This is line with a few studies suggesting sustainability is the determinant of territorial or urban attractiveness (Boivin & Tanguay, 2019; Servillo *et al.*, 2012).

### **Ambition To Be a Green and Global City**

That Jakarta has an ambition to be a global city can be seen through the rhetoric well sounded by the Jakarta regional government officials, including and more often by Governor Anies. On many occasions like discussion fora and inauguration events, the tagline "Jakarta Global City" and "Jakarta Kota Global" have been delivered to Jakarta's public. For instance, at the recent city anniversary celebration, Governor Anies vowed that Jakarta has been entering the era of global city as the city consistently provides international standard infrastructure, implements massive digital technology in governance, hosts global events, and gains international recognitions for its significant development (Jakarta Regional Government, 2022a). The taglines are also popular in social media with the hashtag #JakartaKotaGlobal and #JakartaGlobalCity. Furthermore,



looking at sustainability-driven global trend applied in the city development, Governor Anies once declared the ambition that Jakarta leads in sustainable transportation (Antara, 2022a) in addition to becoming one of the world's greenest mega-cities (Modern Diplomacy, 2019).

Strongly linked to economic geography, global cities are often associated with the product of globalization as the main driver of global economy and the push of economic interdependence among countries. Global cities are believed to function as "critical governance nodes in global production networks" (Parnreiter, 2019). However, global cities no longer act solely as the hubs of economy and investment referring to "elite cities" as there have been various global challenges as well as changes and demands. Global cities today also act as hubs of sport and tourism, education and culture, innovation and technology, and politics. Since global cities are the hubs of human interactions, they are melting pots of diverse nations and cultures. In addition to hosting global events, global cities are home to international organizations, business entities, and think-tanks. It is widely known that global cities have soft power referring to the capability of attracting and influencing audiences both foreign governments and non-governments. Furthermore, Lee (2016) notes that environmental attractiveness is one of dimensions forming soft power which affects international business, tourism, and migration.

However, there has been rising awareness that cities – including those widely known as global cities – not only act as the world's development engine (Balbim, 2016), but they also contribute to causing global problems like climate crisis and resources scarcity due to their intolerable glasshouse gas and huge energy consumption. They are deemed responsible to take part of addressing the problems parallel with the rising city roles. Even current climate change governance is the evolution of city interventions through policy experiments by city governments to have begun since late 1980s and early 1990s (Bulkeley & Broto, 2013).

Sustainability has become a key issue as a new urban agenda among cities as well as a grand strategy to be resilient to face global challenges. Environmental sustainability particularly has been a common principle demanded by people in the cities to be articulated in city development policies (Kellison & Hong, 2015). Even those which have been recognized as today high-ranking global cities like London, New York City, and Tokyo, the city governments are attempting to implement sustainability to their local development. Considering this phenomenon, being global and green are two things which will be well-attached in the future. In other words, environmental sustainability can be one of the future indicators – not only economic power – to label a city to be a global city which has important role in tackling climate crisis through local green development.

Jakarta's intention to become a new green and global city has been followed by the constructions and revitalizations of public facilities and the hosting of international events which pave the city transformation. While modern and internationally recognized facilities are needed to facilitate human interactions in the city, environmental sustainability is necessarily applied as a current global trend. Through facilities and events as city-brand communication (Kavaratzis, 2004, 2009), Jakarta has been attempting to communicate its transformation to not only its local but also international audiences. Among such infrastructure and events, the JIS and the Jakarta E-Prix are the most attractive and well-



resonated with which the Jakarta regional government expects to help spreading the message on the city transformation to be a green and global city.

While the most conversations on stadiums in Indonesia are still restricted to whether the main fields complying with the FIFA's guideline to host official matches, the JIS provides more features such as retractable roof, non-athletic track, and green technology like stadiums in developed cities in which sport has become a promising industry. According to Daily Mail report, the JIS is one of the ten most luxurious modern stadiums in the world along with other prominent stadiums, such as the World Cup's Lusail Stadium in Qatar, the upgraded Santiago Bernabeu Stadium in Madrid, the Stadio Della Roma in Rome, and others (Daily Mail, 2020). All the stadiums in the list have similarity, that is applying green technology in their designs to anticipate future relevance.

The JIS is projected to host international football matches which will be able to seat many fans in the future. In addition, the stadium is designated to be a stadium tourism destination since stadium tourism is a growing area within sports tourism (Edensor *et al.*, 2021). The practice of promoting stadiums as the tourist attraction has been a common practice by the regional governments especially in the cities whose sport industry has developed well. The stadium is also expected to generate the surrounding economy as infrastructure – as practiced in many global cities – should not be erected for only one specific purpose but multi purposes. As argued by Governor Anies, the JIS is built not only for facilitating football games but also for generating and distributing economic development in the city as well as changing the culture of urban mobility from relying on private vehicles to using public transport modes (CNN Indonesia, 2021).

Jakarta hosted one of the Formula E's Season 8 races in June 2022. Though it was the first time the city hosted such race, the Formula E Operation (FEO) claimed that it has made the record-breaking as the most successful race in the Formula E history as it attracted the most online live viewers in addition on-spot spectators compared to other Formula E races (FIA Formula E, 2022). Thanks to the achievement, Jakarta is allowed to host doubleheader races in the next Formula E's Season 9. As one of the motorsport events most covered by media in the world, Jakarta like other host cities definitely takes advantage of media exposure to promote itself and get wide attentions globally (Sturm, 2018). The Jakarta E-Prix has impacted both tourism and economic sector in the city. In addition to having more tourists to visit Jakarta, as studied by the Institute for Development of Economics and Finance (INDEF) the race contributed to the economic impact worth IDR 2.63 trillion to the city on the race day (Tempo, 2022).

As easily recognized by audiences, the existence of the mega-structure like the JIS and the sport mega-event like the Formula E are expected to position Jakarta equal to other global cities. They can be evidence that Jakarta is able to provide the global standard infrastructure as well as global events at home. As a global city acts as a hub of human interaction, the JIS and the Jakarta E-Prix are in line with the city's ambition to be a global hub of sports tourism (Luerdi, 2022a). Thus, more tourists are expected to make their visits to Jakarta and more economic impacts are expected to gain in which city para-diplomacy or city branding has a role in internationalizing the city as suggested by Auschner *et al.*, (2020).

Not only the stadium and the racetrack, but other forms of infrastructure also get attention like cultural centers, public transportation, transit areas, parks, and others to



support the city's transformation. Most of them are designed as multi-functional third public spaces – the spaces referring to other than homes and offices – which emphasize environmental sustainability and inclusiveness as argued by Governor Anies during the public lecture on the "Transformation of Jakarta 2017-2022: Ideas, Narratives, and Works" aired by the CNN Indonesia (CNN Indonesia, 2022). The hard infrastructure provision is believed to gradually change people's behavior in the city as global citizens since global cities are not only about hard infrastructure, but also about soft infrastructure as suggested by Governor Anies (CNN Indonesia, 2022).

As a global city has the power of attraction, for example, in term of attracting investment other than by direct diplomacy, the Jakarta regional government has been attempting to offer several regional projects to investors through the Jakarta Investment Forum (JIF) (Jakarta Investment Center, 2022). The JIF has been a platform to connect the city policy makers and potential investors to sustain its transformation to be a global city through green investments. The JIF is annual forum conducted by the Jakarta regional government to ensure that Jakarta is a friendly investment destination and to persuade both domestic and foreign investors to participate in the city's green projects by providing insight on the development the city has made. The progressive changes in the city in term of green development and the role of city branding as a promotional effort are expected to make Jakarta as one of the most popular investment destinations in Indonesia.

To keep the future continuity of policies for sustainable development and maintain a series of achievements that have been made in the city, the Jakarta regional government has institutionalized the commitment in a form of the 2022 Gubernatorial Regulation Number 31 on the Jakarta's Spatial Detail Planning (Jakarta Regional Government, 2022b). The regulation is literally aims to accelerate the transformation of Jakarta as a center of business and a global city which is transit- and digital-oriented, emphasizing the importance of integrating sustainability to the city development (Jakarta Regional Government, 2022b). The aspect of sustainability specified in the regulation includes not only environmental sustainability but also another value like social justice that city development is supposed to inclusively benefit for all city dwellers. The regulation should be a guidance for the city decision makers and stakeholders in consistently transforming Jakarta to be a green and global city.

Not only do global cities have soft power to attract tourists, investments, and capitals for local development, but they also have interest in extending their role in the international level in addressing global issues (Acuto, 2013b). One of global issues the cities are trying to address is sustainable urban development to face climate crisis. In this case, cities attempt to emphasize the importance of sustainability as a norm and sustainable development as a common goal not only among cities but also towards national governments. For instance, by the G20 Summit held in November 2022 in Bali, Indonesia, the U20 – one of the G20 pillars consisting of a few cities of the G20 member countries co-chaired by Jakarta – deliberated and formulated some recommendations on urban development particularly and clean energy transition and climate change adaptation generally to national governments of the G20 (Fathun, 2022; Luerdi, 2022b).

The international networks of cities, such as the U20, C40 Cities, UCLG, and others have become opportunity structures in addition to the sustainability norm for Jakarta to project



its para-diplomacy. Furthermore, strong local leadership in implementing sustainability at home contributes to gaining international visibility and recognition (Ruiz-Campillo, 2022). Jakarta as one of the mega-cities within the platforms – under the leadership of Governor Anies – has shown its rising commitment to environmental sustainability at the local level as well as its active engagement in the global level. The active membership strengthened by local initiatives has paved Jakarta to play its international role in addressing sustainability-related issues. Following the announcement of Jakarta's achievement as the most innovative city in the 2021 Sustainable Transport Award in October 2020, Governor Anies together with Governor Yuriko Koike of Tokyo was elected to become the C40 Cities steering committee in December 2020, leading the city organization and assisting to give directions to member cities in addressing climate crisis (C40 Cities, 2020).

The Jakarta regional government as often represented by Governor Anies has been plotted to be one of the main speakers in many international fora of cities, delivering the ideas and narratives of urban sustainability as well as sharing the best practices of sustainable development conducted by Jakarta. For instance, Governor Anies talked about carbon neutrality advancement, city resilience, and initiatives to anticipate climate crisis at the forum of C40 Cities Mayor and the UN Secretary General, which were then approved to be taken for further policies (Fathun, 2022; Luerdi, 2022b). Through the forum, Jakarta attempted to raise awareness of the important role of cities in tackling the global issues and put cities as the important partner of the UN. Speaking before the world's cities and leaders has helped raised the influence and extended the role of Jakarta in international politics. Such increasing role cannot be separated from the city branding effort and vice versa. Based on the city branding concept used in this paper, creating brands by Jakarta also functions as value enhancers – enhancing sustainability – towards not only local but also international audiences as suggested by Hankinson (2004). Meanwhile, the leader's behavior like vision on green development does matter in city-branding communication as proposed by Kavaratzis (2004, 2009).

While the world's cities are attempting to make progress gradually by adopting sustainability to their urban development as well as restructuring themselves to be global, London and Singapore could currently be the world's most recognized green and global cities at the same time. Jakarta is still believed to be not yet as advanced as both cities in term of green development and global attraction. However, the Jakarta regional government has demonstrated the efforts to transform the city to achieve the status as one of the greenest cities and one of the most recognized global cities in the future. Not only has the city made significant progress in urban transport and mobility as previously discussed in this paper, but Jakarta has also become one in the "2018/2019 Top 50 Smart Cities Governments" among the world's 140 cities as studied by Eden Strategy Institute (Eden Strategy Institute, 2018). The governments in global cities are widely known to have applied digital technology massively to manage urban problems and resources. Considering its current local development, international recognitions, and increasing global engagements, this paper suggests Jakarta is one of the world's emerging green and global cities.

Sustainability has been a global agenda among global communities, but thanks to globalization cities like Jakarta can hardly restrict themselves from such issue. From the discussion in this section, it is known that Jakarta attempts to promote its local



development to bring a message that the city is transforming to be a green and global city. The act of promoting such development referring to city branding is the form of para-diplomacy considering dos Santos' study (dos Santos, 2021). Integrating environmental sustainability to the local development through local policies as well as pursuing the status of being a green and global city by the Jakarta regional government can be the efforts to fulfill local specific needs as suggested by Hocking (1993). Even though Jakarta's diplomacy in this paper is more "functionally specific and targeted" and often "opportunistic and experimental" which differentiates it from state diplomacy as suggested by Keating (2013), it has not demonstrated a contradiction against the national government's foreign policy. Instead, what Jakarta has done and achieved can be another promotional tool for nation branding and acceleration of national program of clean energy transition in the country.

## Conclusion

City branding seen as para-diplomacy by the Jakarta regional government is an effort to create new identity or regional characteristic of the city. Building a mega-structure like the JIS and hosting a sport mega-event like the Formula E symbolize the urban green transformation as a local development. As the main communication tools complying with the global norm and trend, both are expected to present a bigger picture of current development that Jakarta is transforming to be a green and global city which is in turn, offering either material or non-material advantages. That "green" and "global" are two characteristics which will be like a two-sided coin in the future is a belief as well as ambition the Jakarta regional government embraces and pursues. Learning from the case of Jakarta with its progressive adoption of sustainability especially under the leadership of Governor Anies, cities have capabilities of implementing global norms at home as well as to project their role beyond national borders. In fact, local initiatives in addition to leadership in the cities encourage more city global engagement and contribution to tackle the climate crisis.

There is an intersection between global, national, and urban challenges, which is that almost all global and national problems can be found in the cities. However, cities can be sources of solution to the problems as they are home to national economic development, technology and innovation, and resources. Current trend shows that cities especially mega-cities in both developed and developing world hardly prevent themselves from current global issues like climate crisis. This paper suggests that the role of cities through either city branding to advance local development as a local need particularly or para-diplomacy which contributes to addressing climate crisis generally become more relevant in the future. Many cases of cities worldwide have shown that city leadership seems to be more aggressive than national leadership in sustainability transformation since national governments have more restrictions than do city governments. Therefore, city development should be capitalized to nation branding and national policies are supposed to encourage cities – in the case of Indonesia, not limited to Jakarta and other big cities – to significantly integrate sustainability to their urban planning. Thus, cities can be pilot projects of national green transformation.

The findings in this study confirm the previous literature that sustainability is now the shared concern and global agenda of cities, especially those well exposed to global city



networks. The cities which enjoy progress in term of sustainability at home tend to expand its role in the global stage through para-diplomacy and at the same time attempt to advance current local development by enhancing global-local collaboration. City branding becomes necessity strengthened by the progressive implementation of sustainability and through which cities are able to internationalize such local development. However, this study contributes to revealing that the city in the global south also attempts to catch up with the global norm and modernity by, for example, introducing an environmentally friendly mega-structure and a net zero-emission sport mega-event which has missed in the literature.

## References

- Acuto, M. (2013a). World politics by other means? London, City diplomacy and the olympics. *The Hague Journal of Diplomacy*, 8(3-4), 287-311. <https://doi.org/10.1163/1871191X-12341255>
- Acuto, M. (2013b). *Global Cities, Governance and Diplomacy: The Urban Link*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203073810>
- Añorve, D. A., Pérez, F. D., & Ramírez, E. M. (2022). Paradiplomacia municipal desde la gobernanza / University Paradiplomacy as an Aid to Municipal Paradiplomacy from a Governance Perspective. *Secuencia*, 114, 1-35. <https://doi.org/10.18234/secuencia.v0i114.2004>
- Antara. (2022a, February 17). *Jakarta aims to lead in sustainable transportation: Governor*. <https://en.antaranews.com/news/215889/jakarta-aims-to-lead-in-sustainable-transportation-governor>
- Antara. (2022b, August 30). *Anies Baswedan bersama delegasi U20 kunjung objek wisata Kota Tua*. <https://www.antaranews.com/berita/3089429/anies-baswedan-bersama-delegasi-u20-kunjungi-objek-wisata-kota-tua>
- Anttiroiko, A.-V. (2015). City branding as a response to global intercity competition. *Growth and Change*, 46(2), 233-252. <https://doi.org/10.1111/grow.12085>
- Auladell, F. V. (2014). From the functional-brand to the emotional-brand and the consumption experience: An approach to the commodification of experiences in signification advertising. *Revista de Comunicación*, 13, 118-143. <https://revistadecomunicacion.com/pdf/2014/Art118-143.pdf>
- Auschner, E., Álvarez, L. L., & Pérez, L. Á. (2020). Paradiplomacy and City Branding: The Case of Medellín, Colombia (2004-2019). In S. Amiri & E. Sevin (Eds.), *City Diplomacy: Current Trends and Future Prospects* (Issue February, pp. 279-303). Palgrave Macmillan. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-45615-3\\_13](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-45615-3_13)
- Bakry, U. S. (2017). *Metode Penelitian Hubungan Internasional* (2nd ed.). Pustaka Pelajar.
- Balbim, R. (2016). City Diplomacy: Global Agendas, Local Agreements. In R. Balbim (Ed.), *The geopolitics of cities: old challenges, new issues* (pp. 123-170). Instituto de Pesquisa Econômica Aplicada. [https://portalantigo.ipea.gov.br/agencia/index.php?option=com\\_content&view=article&](https://portalantigo.ipea.gov.br/agencia/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&)



id=28689

Baswedan, A. R. (2022). *Bank Investasi Eropa Dukung Pembangunan Transportasi Jakarta*. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=0ct6NKJZ0jI>

Biermann, F., Kanie, N., & Kim, R. E. (2017). Global governance by goal-setting: the novel approach of the UN Sustainable Development Goals. *Current Opinion in Environmental Sustainability*, 26–27, 26–31. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cosust.2017.01.010>

Boivin, M., & Tanguay, G. A. (2019). Analysis of the determinants of urban tourism attractiveness: The case of Québec City and Bordeaux. *Journal of Destination Marketing and Management*, 11, 67–79. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jdmm.2018.11.002>

Bulkeley, H., & Broto, V. C. (2013). Government by experiment? Global cities and the governing of climate change. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*, 38(3), 361–375. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1475-5661.2012.00535.x>

C40 Cities. (2020). *Governors of Tokyo and Jakarta elected to C40 Cities Steering Committee*. [https://www.c40.org/news/tokyo-jakarta-steering-committee/#:~:text=Governor of Tokyo%2C Yuriko Koike,to addressing the climate crisis](https://www.c40.org/news/tokyo-jakarta-steering-committee/#:~:text=Governor%2C%20Yuriko%20Koike,to%20addressing%20the%20climate%20crisis)

CNN Indonesia. (2021). *Jakarta International Stadium, Ikon Baru Ibu Kota - Insight with Desi Anwar*. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=lObjoeWFZ5E>

CNN Indonesia. (2022). *Transformasi Jakarta 2017-2022: Gagasan, Narasi dan Karya*. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=cOjEUWuQ9EA>

Daily Mail. (2020, February 20). *While investors are put off by crumbling Old Trafford, Beckham is building a stunning £766m Miami base and Barcelona are spending £540m on the Nou Camp... these 10 stadiums put the "Theatre of Dreams" to shame*. <https://www.dailymail.co.uk/sport/football/article-8005891/While-Old-Trafford-rots-ten-best-football-stadiums-set-built-world.html>

dos Santos, N. de A. e S. F. (2021). Crossroads between city diplomacy and city branding towards the future: case study on the film cities at UNESCO Creative Cities Network. *Place Branding and Public Diplomacy*, 17(1), 105–125. <https://doi.org/10.1057/s41254-020-00174-3>

Eden Strategy Institute. (2018). *Top 50 smart city governments*. [https://www.edenstrategyinstitute.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/07/Eden-OXD\\_Top50SmartCityGovernments.pdf](https://www.edenstrategyinstitute.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/07/Eden-OXD_Top50SmartCityGovernments.pdf)

Edensor, T., Millington, S., Steadman, C., & Taecharungroj, V. (2021). Towards a comprehensive understanding of football stadium tourism. *Journal of Sport and Tourism*, 25(3), 217–235. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14775085.2021.1884589>

Erlandsen, M. (2018). Twitter as a tool of para-diplomacy: An exploratory cohort study based on Catalonia (2013-2017). *Revista Chilena de Relaciones Internacionales*, 2(1), 211–231. <https://rchri.cl/wp-content/uploads/2018/04/211-231.pdf>

Fathun, L. M. (2022). Peran Paradiplomacy dalam Presidensi G20 Indonesia: Studi Kasus Diplomasi Kota Jakarta pada Urban 20. *Indonesian Perspective*, 7(1), 57–78. <https://doi.org/10.14710/ip.v7i1.48595>





- Fermeglia, M. (2017). The Show Must Be Green: Hosting Mega-Sporting Events in the Climate Change Context. *Carbon & Climate Law Review*, 11(2), 100–109. <https://doi.org/10.21552/cclr/2017/2/6>
- FIA Formula E. (2022). *ABB FIA Formula E World Championship*. <https://www.fiaformulae.com/en/discover/history>
- Hankinson, G. (2004). Relational network brands: Towards a conceptual model of place brands. *Journal of Vacation Marketing*, 10(2), 109–121. <https://doi.org/10.1177/135676670401000202>
- Hocking, B. (1993). *Localizing Foreign Policy: Non-Central Governments and Multilayered Diplomacy* (1st Ed.). St. Martin's Press, Inc.
- Hulberg, J. (2006). Integrating corporate branding and sociological paradigms: A literature study. *Journal of Brand Management*, 14(1–2), 60–73. <https://doi.org/10.1057/palgrave.bm.2550054>
- ITDP. (2021). *2021: Jakarta, Indonesia*. <https://www.staward.org/past-winners/njn8kpckm7tdulhfuregut19pv2tg>
- Jak Lingko Indonesia. (2022). *Jak Lingko Indonesia: About Us*. <https://www.jaklingkoindonesia.co.id/id/tentang-kami>
- Jakarta Investment Center. (2022). *Jakarta Investment Forum: Projects*. <https://invest.jakarta.go.id/jakarta-investment-forum>
- Jakarta Post. (2021, December 4). *More than just a stadium*. <https://www.thejakartapost.com/opinion/2021/12/03/more-than-just-a-stadium.html>
- Jakarta Propertindo. (2022). *JIS Stadion Modern yang Mengusung Konsep Berkelanjutan Dengan Standar FIFA*. <https://www.jakarta-propertindo.com/jis-stadion-modern-yang-mengusung-konsep-berkelanjutan-dengan-standar-fifa/>
- Jakarta Regional Government. (2020, November). Innovations To Develop The Transportation. *Media Jaya: Information Media of The Provincial Government of DKI Jakarta*, 10–13. [https://jakita.jakarta.go.id/media/download/eng/edisi\\_11\\_2020.pdf](https://jakita.jakarta.go.id/media/download/eng/edisi_11_2020.pdf)
- Jakarta Regional Government. (2021a). *Jakarta Climate Resilient City: Best Practices Compilation 2021*. <https://rendahemisi.jakarta.go.id/page/downloadContentFile/166>
- Jakarta Regional Government. (2021b). *Jakarta Rendah Emisi: Collaboration Partners*. <https://rendahemisi.jakarta.go.id/en/collaborations>
- Jakarta Regional Government. (2022a). *Malam Puncak Jakarta Hajatan ke-495, Gubernur Anies Kukuhkan Jakarta sebagai Kota Global*. [https://beritajakarta.id/read/102055/Malam\\_Puncak\\_Jakarta\\_Hajatan\\_ke-495\\_Gubernur\\_Anies\\_Kukuhkan\\_Jakarta\\_sebagai\\_Kota\\_Global#.Y1YQMXZBy3B](https://beritajakarta.id/read/102055/Malam_Puncak_Jakarta_Hajatan_ke-495_Gubernur_Anies_Kukuhkan_Jakarta_sebagai_Kota_Global#.Y1YQMXZBy3B)
- Jakarta Regional Government. (2022b). *Sosialisasi Peraturan Gubernur Nomor 31 Tahun 2022 - RDTR DKI Jakarta 2022*. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6oVRKc2gnMU>
- Jelinčić, D. A., Vukić, F., & Kostešić, I. (2017). The City is more than just a Destination: An Insight into City Branding Practices in Croatia. *Sociologija i Prostor*, 55(1), 117–134. <https://doi.org/10.5673/sip.55.1.6>



- Kasapi, I., & Cela, A. (2017). Destination Branding: A Review of the City Branding Literature. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences*, 8(4), 129–142. <https://doi.org/10.1515/mjss-2017-0012>
- Kavaratzis, M. (2004). From city marketing to city branding: Towards a theoretical framework for developing city brands. *Place Branding*, 1(1), 58–73. <https://doi.org/10.1057/palgrave.pb.5990005>
- Kavaratzis, M. (2009). Cities and their brands: Lessons from corporate branding. *Place Branding and Public Diplomacy*, 5(1), 26–37. <https://doi.org/10.1057/pb.2008.3>
- Keating, M. (2013). Regions and International Affairs: Motives, Opportunities and Strategies. In F. Aldecoa & M. Keating (Eds.), *Paradiplomacy in Action: The Foreign Relations of Subnational Governments* (pp. 1–16). Routledge.
- Kellison, T. B., & Hong, S. (2015). The adoption and diffusion of pro-environmental stadium design. *European Sport Management Quarterly*, 15(2), 249–269. <https://doi.org/10.1080/16184742.2014.995690>
- Kuznetsov, A. (2015). *Theory and Practice of Paradiplomacy: Subnational Governments in International Affairs*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315817088>
- Lecours, A. (2002). Paradiplomacy: Reflections on the Foreign Policy and IR of Regions. *International Negotiation*, 7(1), 91–114. [https://brill.com/view/journals/iner/7/1/article-p91\\_8.xml](https://brill.com/view/journals/iner/7/1/article-p91_8.xml)
- Lecours, A. (2008). Political Issues of Paradiplomacy: Lessons from the Developed World. In *Discussion Papers in Diplomacy*. Netherlands Institute of International Relations 'Clingendael.' <http://www.jstor.com/stable/resrep05373>
- Lee, K.-H. (2016). The conceptualization of country attractiveness: a review of research. *International Review of Administrative Sciences*, 82(4), 807–826. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0020852314566002>
- Lee, T. (2014). *Global cities and climate change: The translocal relations of environmental governance* (1st Ed.). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315818078>
- Luerdi, L. (2022a). Para-Diplomacy in Time of Covid- 19 : Jakarta Regional Government's Objectives in Hosting International Youth Championship. *Resolusi: Jurnal Sosial Politik*, 5(1), 38–51. <https://doi.org/https://dx.doi.org/10.32699/resolusi.v5i1.2782>
- Luerdi, L. (2022b). "Street" Diplomacy, Regional Development, and Sustainable Urban Mobility Collaboration. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.31219/osf.io/wh97s>
- Magnusson, J., & Rachmita, F. (2021, January). Jakarta Is What Resiliency Looks Like. *Sustainable Transport Magazine*, 32, 6–8. [https://www.itdp.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/03/ITDP\\_ST32\\_web.pdf](https://www.itdp.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/03/ITDP_ST32_web.pdf)
- McDowell, M. L. (2022). The Falkland Islands, international sporting competition, and evolving (post-Brexit) paradiplomacy. *Small States & Territories*, 5(1), 87–102. <https://www.um.edu.mt/library/oar/handle/123456789/94158>
- Meissner, R., & Warner, J. (2021). Indigenous paradiplomacy and the Orokawe hydroelectric dam on the Kunene River. *Regions and Cohesion*, 11(1), 21–48.



<https://doi.org/10.3167/reco.2021.110103>

Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative Data Analysis: An Expanded Sourcebook* (2nd ed.). Sage Publication, Inc.

Modern Diplomacy. (2019). *World's largest public bus system begins transition to electric vehicles*. <https://moderndiplomacy.eu/2019/06/01/worlds-largest-public-bus-system-begins-transition-to-electric-vehicles/>

Mol, A. P. J., & Zhang, L. (2012). Sustainability as Global Norm: The Greening of Mega-Events in China. In G. Hayes & J. Karamichas (Eds.), *Olympic Games, Mega-Events and Civil Societies* (pp. 126–150). Palgrave Macmillan UK. [https://doi.org/10.1057/9780230359185\\_7](https://doi.org/10.1057/9780230359185_7)

Noori, N., & De Jong, M. (2018). Towards Credible City Branding Practices: How Do Iran's Largest Cities Face Ecological Modernization? *Sustainability*, 10(5), 1–16. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su10051354>

Oxford University Press. (2022). *Oxford Learner's Dictionaries*. <https://www.oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com/definition/english/branding?q=branding>

Parnreiter, C. (2019). Global cities and the geographical transfer of value. *Urban Studies*, 56(1), 81–96. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0042098017722739>

Ramadhan, F., Susiatiningsih, H., & Wahyudi, F. E. (2022). Paradiplomasi Provinsi DKI Jakarta Terkait Penyelenggaraan Formula E. *Journal of International Relations*, 8(3), 489–498. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.14710/jirud.v8i3.34657>

Robeers, T., & Van Den Bulck, H. (2018). Towards an Understanding of Side-Lining Environmental Sustainability in Formula E: Traditional Values and the Emergence of eSports. *Athens Journal of Sports*, 5(4), 331–350. <https://doi.org/10.30958/ajspo.5-4-7>

Ruiz-Campillo, X. (2022). The drive to sustainability: A way in which local initiatives diffuse internationally. *Politics & Policy*, 50(5), 967–991. <https://doi.org/10.1111/polp.12496>

Servillo, L., Atkinson, R., & Russo, A. P. (2012). Territorial attractiveness in EU urban and spatial policy: A critical review and future research agenda. *European Urban and Regional Studies*, 19(4), 349–365. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0969776411430289>

Sodiq, A., Baloch, A. A. B., Khan, S. A., Sezer, N., Mahmoud, S., Jama, M., & Abdelaal, A. (2019). Towards modern sustainable cities: Review of sustainability principles and trends. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 227, 972–1001. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.04.106>

Sport Business. (2022, October 13). *Formula E reports 20-per-cent rise in cumulative audience*. <https://www.sportbusiness.com/news/formula-e-reports-20-per-cent-rise-in-cumulative-audience/>

Sturm, D. (2018). Formula E's 'green' challenge to motorsport events, spaces and technologies. In H. Seraphin & E. Nolan (Eds.), *Green Events and Green Tourism* (1st Ed., pp. 145–153). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429445125-15>

Suharyadi, I. (2016). Peran Penting Asia Africa Smart City Summit (AASCS) 2015



- Terhadap Perkembangan Paradiplomasi Kota Bandung. *Global: Jurnal Politik Internasional*, 18(1), 95. <https://doi.org/10.7454/global.v18i1.37>
- Tempo. (2022, June 24). *Dampak Ekonomi Formula E Rp 2,6 Triliun, Anies: Menggerakkan Perekonomian Jakarta*. <https://metro.tempo.co/read/1605421/dampak-ekonomi-formula-e-rp-26-triliun-anies-menggerakkan-perekonomian-jakarta>
- TomTom International. (2020). *TomTom Traffic Index Ranking 2020*. <https://www.tomtom.com/traffic-index/ranking/>
- TUMI. (2021). *21Heroes2021*. <https://www.transformative-mobility.org/publications/21heroes2021>
- Ulldemolins, J. R. (2014). Culture and authenticity in urban regeneration processes: Place branding in central Barcelona. *Urban Studies*, 51(14), 3026–3045. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0042098013515762>
- United Nations. (n.d.). *Sustainable Development Goals*. Retrieved October 9, 2022, from <https://sdgs.un.org/goals>
- Zamorano, M. M., & Morató, A. R. (2015). The cultural paradiplomacy of Barcelona since the 1980s: understanding transformations in local cultural paradiplomacy. *International Journal of Cultural Policy*, 21(5), 554–576. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10286632.2014.943752>
- Zeraoui, Z., & Villar, F. R. C. (2016). La paradiplomacia de la ciudad: Una estrategia de desarrollo urbano / The Paradiplomacy of the Cities: A Strategy of Urban Development. *Reforma y Democracia*, 65, 225–242. <https://www.redalyc.org/pdf/3575/357546620008.pdf>